

## Assessment Challenges Faced by Technical Vocational Education (TVET) Stakeholders in Pakistan: Stakeholders' Perspectives

\* Gouhar Pirzada, PhD Scholar

\*\* Dr. Yaar Muhammad, Assistant Professor (Corresponding Author)

\*\*\* Dr. Aisha Mahmood, Assistant Professor

### Abstract



*In the modern developmental era, the role of highly trained individuals in national development has become crucially important, but it is also an undeniable reality that Pakistan's shortage of highly qualified workers is growing. Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) was established to prepare a skilled workforce for various industries and sectors in Pakistan; however, the 60 percent level of young, unskilled, and semi-skilled labor emerging is mainly attributable to the failure of TVET to meet the country's needs for the trained workforce for the economy. This paper aims to develop an understanding of Pakistani NVQ stakeholders' perspectives on current assessment issues, effective implementation of assessments, and potential roles and responsibilities of related stakeholders. This article examines the assessment challenges encountered by TVET stakeholders in Pakistan. This study's primary objective is to understand Pakistani NVQ stakeholders' perspectives on current assessment issues, the effective implementation of assessments, and the potential roles and responsibilities of related stakeholders. By adopting a qualitative research design, the data were collected from 40 TVET stakeholders working in different positions in TVET sectors.. The findings from this study highlighted six main challenges that are: difficulty in managing professional courses, internal/external trainers' problems, implementation of CBT as a challenge, industrial-related challenges, language problems, and student competencies as a challenge. Each one of these is discussed in detail.*

**Keywords:** Assessments, Stakeholder's Perspectives, TVET, Pakistan, Challenges

### Introduction

The socio-economic development of every civilization depends heavily on education (Mends-Brew and Dadzie, 2016). The ideal educational setting for socio-economic advancement is TVET (Technical Vocational Education and Training). TVET is believed to significantly impact providing the necessary human capital needed by enterprises (Anderson, 2009). Even though it has changed in form and focus throughout time, the human capital theory has been endorsed by national governments as well as international financial organizations, including the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund (IMF), and the International Labor Organization (ILO) (Anderson 2009). As a result, the significance and value of TVET can be seen, and with this background in mind, the researchers need to investigate, analyze, and scrutinize TVET in a developing country like Pakistan. According to Beardwell et al., (2004), a skilled and educated workforce is critical for the economy's effective functioning, competitiveness, and overall societal well-being.

UNESCO defines TVET as "those aspects of the educational process involving, in addition to general education, the study of technologies and related sciences and the acquisition of practical skills, attitudes, understanding, and knowledge relating to occupation in various sectors of economic life." UNESCO (2014) stated that TVET is about more than just providing people with job skills. TVET, on the other hand, concentrates on information, skills, and attitudes that might contribute to an individual's holistic development. TVET may be very important in tackling the high percentage of unemployment in the developing world, especially among those between the ages of 15 and 30. Mends-Brew and Dadzie (2016) supported TVET by arguing that the goal of TVET is to provide graduates with the practical knowledge and skills needed in the industry (Anderson, 2009). This work

\* Lincoln University College, Malaysia

\*\* Department of Education, University of Management and Technology, Lahore

\*\*\* Department of STEM Education, Division of Education University of Education, Lahore

demonstrates the critical significance that TVET plays in the growth of a nation. Governments and politicians must thus see TVET as a vehicle for battling underemployment, unemployment, and the other social ills that will plague their society. The authors' reasoning paints a relatively clear picture of television education. However, this interdependence can only happen if the correct and suitable structures are established to establish TVET on a solid foundation that will allow it to achieve significant benefits. TVET might significantly reduce the high unemployment rate in developing countries, particularly among those between the ages of 15 and 30. The purpose of TVET, according to Mends-Brew and Dadzie (2016), is to provide graduates with the practical knowledge and abilities required in the workplace. This argument offers crucial support for TVET (Anderson, 2009).

### **Literature Review**

Vocational education can be defined as a sort of education that tries to develop individuals' cognitive, affective, and psychomotor behaviors necessary to be qualified and to prepare persons for their professional lives through these acquired behaviors (Pirzada, Muhammad, & Anis, 2020). According to various definitions and as described above, vocational education is a process of educating individuals with knowledge and skills (Arifin, 2015). Vocational education is the process of acquiring current skills and knowledge about specific occupations and developing and maturing individual behaviors and business-related habits (Beardwell et al., 2004). When these concepts are considered, vocational education refers to a teaching and learning system that focuses on providing individuals with the required knowledge and skills to succeed in a specific industry (Pirzada, Muhammad, & Ahmed, 2021). From this perspective, vocational education is critical to a country's social and economic development. Vocational education serves various purposes in terms of society, business, and the person. In vocational education, contributions to societal prosperity and economic progress take center stage. On a functional level, there is efficient production, increased research, development capacity, and competition; on a personal level, there is preparing individuals for business life, offering employment options, and training based on market needs.

The major goal of vocational education in Pakistan is to prepare people for life, higher education, and the labor market by increasing their knowledge, skills, and competencies (Pirzada, Muhammad, & Masood, 2021). Vocational education is built on equipping individuals with information and skills and preparation for further education and business life. Secondary schools that train students as the labor force for the commercial and occupational sectors and prepare students for further education in general secondary-level education are known as vocational and technical schools (Beardwell et al., 2004). When looking at the evolution of these institutions, it is clear that vocational and technical education in the early years of Pakistan was severely lacking. Secondary vocational schools are established to allow people to start businesses after completing their primary education. The Ministry of Education, the centralized national education organization, used numerous legislations to achieve this goal. Despite initiatives to improve vocational education in Pakistan, the country's requirements for vocational education institutions have not been met. Many studies have been undertaken to build these educational institutions, and various types of vocational education have been implemented in Pakistan and worldwide (Arifin, 2015).

Three types of educational models appear in the history of vocational and technical education. The first is the "School-centered Model," in which all education takes place full-time at school; the second is the "Business-centered Model," in which education takes place full-time in businesses; and the third is the "Binary System Model," which is business-centered through collaboration between schools and businesses (Cheong & Lee, 2016). The most relevant and practical model for Pakistan now is school-business collaboration. With this strategy, students study at school and at business internship practices. However, because this model has not yet reached the anticipated level, it is difficult to say whether Pakistan's common vocational education goals have been attained. Various studies have been conducted from the early years to today for vocational education in Pakistan to meet its goals. For example, in Turkey, attempts have been made to revitalize the binary system through inter-ministerial cooperation, but relations between the business sector and schools deteriorated in the 1960s as the system failed to address the needs of enterprises. Relations between corporations and schools began to improve again after the 1970s (Ngware et al., 2022).

With time, the secondary education system was reformed, focusing on vocational and technical education. New programmers would prepare students for life and higher education, and a flexible structure would be built to allow lateral and vertical transfer (Chamadia & Shahid, 2018).

Despite the fact that vocational education plays a vital role in the development of the country and society in general, rather than correcting problems in vocational education, problems appear to be growing daily, and vocational high schools have become somewhat dysfunctional (Msibi, 2021). Although various researchers have proposed answers to the challenges encountered in the Pakistan education system and the private sector about vocational education, the problems in vocational education have not been overcome. The inability to handle problems in vocational education has resulted in a cascade of issues affecting higher education on the one hand and prohibits the training of an intermediate workforce to the level required by the labor market.

Another crucial step in gathering data and reaching conclusions about whether someone has acquired competence is competency-based evaluation. Competence-based assessment, also known as a criterion-referenced method, evaluates pupils following pre-established standards or criteria, such as those stated in units of competency or authorized modules (Msibi, 2021). The Australian Skills Quality Authority states that to provide students with real skills applicable to their industry or workplace, assessment tool makers must make sure that the tools are contextualized to the student cohort. The components of the unit of competence serve as the framework for the assessment's observable criteria, and tasks must be created to provide the assessment with context. The capacity of learners to do all of the activities stated in the unit or module's sections at the required level in a range of situations and settings is evaluated. The use of assessment tools is made for this goal. The assessment tool is defined as "the context and conditions of assessment, tasks to be administered to the student, an outline of the evidence to be acquired from the candidate, and evidence criteria used to determine the quality of performance." Performance Criteria, they add, describe the level of performance required in relevant tasks, positions, and talents to signal element achievement. The RTO is then in charge of creating the required activities and evaluating performance against the performance criteria while demonstrating the demonstrated abilities that apply to the product and process (Msibi, 2021).

When contextualizing units of competency, evaluators must not reduce the number of elements or their content. They may add industry-specific terminology to performance criteria if doing so does not distort or narrow the competency outcomes, and they may amend and add to the range statement if doing so does not. Instead of modifying the substance of a unit of competence, contextualization means adapting it to a particular situation, cohort, or person (Ramaligela, 2022).

In light of this presumption, performance assessment tasks must have observation criteria that the assessor watches the applicant fulfill while completing the assessment task and that mirror the performance standards and supporting unit of competence (Msibi, 2021). Knowledge assessment activities must be included in addition to performance assessment tasks to determine what the person needs to know to do the work activity outlined in the unit of competence safely and effectively. When utilizing assessment tools to ascertain competence, it is also essential to consider the testing environment. These conditions may include any mandatory assessment requirements, the circumstances under which evidence for assessment must be gathered, and any information regarding the tools and supplies that must be used, contingencies, specifications, physical circumstances, interactions with team members and supervisors, interactions with clients or customers, and time constraints. Assessors' requirements may also be included, such as educational requirements, professional experience, and industry expertise (Ramaligela, 2022). The purpose of involving the industry during the planning phase is to help choose the evaluation methods that RTO should use. This may be a challenging route for a training provider to walk since there is a chance that conflicting requests from various stakeholders will arise. There are two themes that each of the stakeholders has in common. The first is the competence unit's goal. The second thing to consider is the person's performance standard (Wahba, 2012). The performance criteria and performance evidence for the unit of competence include descriptions. Duplicating or nearly duplicating the performance evidence is the optimal observation criterion for a specific performance task, and the performance evidence requirements are based on this. This is so because units of competence constitute a competency standard, hence a set of observable criteria.

The regulator is just as fallible as those being regulated; thus, it will be challenging to analyze large and complicated volumes of data concerning laws and regulated businesses (Milio et al., 2014). The quality of the training and assessments may decrease due to the challenges of meeting the complex requirements of several authorities for an RTO. Competence understanding, implementation, and evaluation are said to be difficult for trainers. Assessors need a set of standards or benchmarks to measure applicants' skills against to decide if they are competent. It may be difficult for RTOs and their Assessors to navigate these many, sometimes contradicting, rules (Ramaligela, 2022).

As a result, identifying the assessment issues revealed in vocational education research studies and developing solid answers to these issues is critical (Milio et al., 2014). The current study's researchers think that a deep analysis of this sector's assessment system will help provide a more comprehensive view of the difficulties that vocational education faces and the solutions. In this study, researchers looked at studies on understanding Pakistani NVQ stakeholders' perspectives on current assessment issues, their practical implementation, and stakeholders' perspectives on the potential roles and responsibilities of related stakeholders.

### **Research Objectives**

1. Understanding Pakistani NVQ stakeholders' perspectives on current assessment issues.
2. Understanding Pakistani NVQ stakeholder's perspectives on effective implementation of assessments.
3. Understanding Pakistani NVQ stakeholder's perspectives on the potential roles and responsibilities of related stakeholders.

### **Research Questions**

1. What are stakeholders' perspectives on current assessment issues in the context of Pakistan NVQ?
2. What are stakeholders' perspectives on the effective implementation of assessments in the light of Pakistan NVQ?
3. What are stakeholders' perspectives on the potential roles and responsibilities of related stakeholders in the light of Pakistan NVQ?

### **Research Methodology**

The specific viewpoints and ideas of the participants who took part in this study are represented by the qualitative research design. An exploratory research strategy is advantageous for this study since it analyses complicated and understudied topics. The researcher uses the perspectives of many respondents to get insights and in-depth knowledge of a previously under-researched subject in qualitative research, according to Stebbins (2001). With an exploratory research approach, a researcher may use their imagination and let the respondents talk about the phenomena to provide a broad context for the essential topics (Stebbins, 2001). Semi-structured telephone interviews were undertaken to collect the participants' lived experiences and their interpretations of these encounters.

Data were collected from a total of 40 participants, from 20 members through semi-structured telephonic interviews, and the data from the remaining 20 were collected through a focus group. The participants from the telephonic interviews were those who actively associated with the TVET sector. Their experiences of working in the TVET sector were kept in mind during the participants' selection process. All participants work in the TVET industry in substantial teaching or administrative capacities, and there were six members from Punjab TEVTA, four from PBTC, four from NAVTAC, two from Sindh TEVTA, one member from AJ TEVTA, three members from KP TEVTA.

Moreover, all members in the focus group were those stakeholders who were directly involved in the policy-making process. The focus group includes two members from QABs, two from the Punjab Board, two from NAVTAC headquarters, four from the chamber of commerce, six from the Private sector, three from the KP board of Technical education, and one member from Sindh TEVTA.

In Pakistan, there is little research on the assessment Challenges encountered by Pakistani Vocational Qualifications by analyzing Stakeholders' Perspectives. As a result, it was critical to gather the valuable ideas of different stakeholders who have worked in this field for a long time and are familiar with their organization's many initiatives. As a result, the purposive sample technique was used to target trainers from various technical and vocational colleges all around the country.

Semi-structured interviews were quite helpful in maximizing data output and obtaining enhanced data to meet the objectives of various subject areas. Structured, semi-structured, and unstructured interviews are the three types of interviews (Bryman, 2016). The 20 participants who

give semi-structured interviews belong to different cities in the country. Therefore, it was decided to conduct telephonic interviews. The 20 participants from the focus group mainly belong to the head office but represent different zonal areas of the country. The focus group participants were seated together at a private hotel in the city.

Thematic analysis was used to examine the data that was gathered. Thematic analysis is a method for finding, examining, and reporting data patterns used in qualitative research (Braun & Clarke, 2006). The emerging patterns assisted in determining the most critical and frequent components of the evaluation research. Pakistani vocational qualifications confront the following challenges: The stakeholders' viewpoints helped produce critical insights.

### **Findings**

Six primary challenges encountered by the stakeholders in the TVET sector were identified based on the focus group and interview sessions with the forty participants, and these challenges will be described in the following subsections:

#### **Difficulty in managing professional courses**

Vocational stakeholders have the chance to oversee professional development initiatives (courses, seminars, industrial placements, etc.) aimed at advancing students' subject-specific expertise and professionalism. The participants did, however, point up several obstacles that prevent vocational teachers from participating in such programs, including an unaligned course outline, teaching level 4 and 5 qualifications, a lack of evidence guidelines, and resultantly revision. Following are the opinions of the participants on these:

“The courses in year-long qualifications are needed to be aligned and offered in a sequence. Also, previously, we were used to following the course outline week-wise, which made it easier for teachers, but now the course outline is followed topic-wise, which is difficult to manage the formative assessments too...the evaluation system is also not challenging; as it should not only be based on MCQs and short answers.” (Statement 1)

“We only teach level 2 and 3 courses, and the maximum institutes are not going to levels 4 and 5. There are also problems with missing levels, there are qualifications with straight levels from 2 to 4, and at times, there is a lack of clarity about where one level is completed. Clear milestones/objectives must be mentioned.” (Statement 12)

“Evidence guides are required to be revisited regularly, and resultantly revision and corrections may be adopted and communicated to everyone for standardization.” (Statement 15)

The critical necessity to address this technological development and changes among the vocational stakeholders is made clear by the constantly evolving technology in TVET. They must continuously improve their professionalism in terms of their knowledge and abilities. They should also welcome acquiring new information and abilities in their specialized sectors, which they may impart to their students also.

#### **Internal/External Trainers' Problems**

Many stakeholders lack the necessary information to access the student's abilities and sufficient knowledge and expertise in their respective professions. Rapid technology advancements have led to the introduction a new CBT system that mandates instructors teach new abilities in specific topics. To adapt to the current technology demands and developments, vocational teachers and internal and external examiners must multitask and become experts in new skills. One of the participants gave the following response to this:

“Every year, we invite externals for examination who have more or less a similar qualification, but we have never had more qualified examiners who could challenge us and inspire us to move a step above in training. On the other hand, sometimes the examiners do not have any vocational background, which does nothing justice to the examination process.” (Statement 2)

The other participants revealed their situation and commented,

“Assessment must be conducted by certified assessors who have been fully trained to deal with learners' psychological issues too and who can keep the integrity of examination with full decor and discipline. An observation panel comprising the Principle, HOD, one relevant instructor and one industry representative could be made. The observation panel should also be required to do a Pre-assessment center check to see if exam-related resources are adequately available.” (Statement 4)

“Instructors might think all assessments are easier, but sometimes, these are hard for trainees. Can’t we have an assessment bank that should have a good number of similar assessments that trainees take up? This will allow everyone to prepare well and not get surprised on assessment day. Also, the assessment packs until level 3 qualifications must be reviewed regularly.” (Statement 8)

### **Implementation of CBT as a challenge**

Competency-based training (CBT) focuses on what an individual can perform after finishing a training programme in the workplace. CBT focuses more on “performing” than just “knowing.” A competency-based training system includes more than merely training programmes focused on improving work performance. It indicates the degree of proficiency necessary for various degrees of performance within a certain occupational activity (Ngure, 2013). A CBT programme’s progress is not focused on time. CBT emphasizes the capacity to transfer and adapt skills, information, and attitudes to new circumstances and locations in addition to the fundamental duties needed in the workplace, which is a key feature. The participant’s remarks about the reported occurrences demonstrate that,

“Continuing the CBT approach at Level 5, how do we deal with some additional/theoretical subjects since usually there are no evidence guides for theoretical subjects? Can we do a dual system that declares a candidate either Competent or NYC in the practical/competencies part of the qualification, and at the same time, we issue them with detailed results based on exams for other subjects?” (Statement 3)

“The assessment systems at lower levels of NVQF are not generally implemented in the true spirit of CBT&A. I understand that the CBT system allows candidates to get an assessment whenever they want, but in reality, QABs do not give that opportunity.” (Statement 3)

“Level 5 has not been widely implemented under the CBT&A approach. I am always stuck with the thought that if we are ready to offer competitive level 5 qualifications everywhere, which must be equivalent to Intermediate level education as suggested by NVQF. Do we have related and required industry tools, equipment, and mechanical support? Otherwise, what’s the point of following CBT until level 4.” (Statement 7)

Despite the difficulties that arose with the adoption and growth of CBT at the technical institutions, it significantly contributed to the education of highly qualified and competent graduates that are required to support the expanding industry in the nation and the sub-region. However, these issues must be resolved for the nation to successfully apply and promote the CBT philosophy of teaching and learning.

### **Industrial related challenges**

Engineering graduates from regional or international colleges serve as vocational instructors at vocational institutes for skills training. Although the majority of their learning has been theoretical, teaching the practical-based curriculum necessitates teaching skills more (70%) and less (30 percent). As a result, it is challenging to make necessary arrangements with the industrial members without assistance from management. Therefore, vocational educators must have practical expertise in the related domains that align with the competence units. Additionally, it will aid in evaluating “lessons learned” and fostering ongoing improvement. A participant described this phenomenon as follows:

“NAVTTTC, TEVTAs, QABs and respective industry should jointly arrange ‘industry validation workshop’ regularly at least twice a year to prepare for two assessments in one year. This will help in updating and upgrading assessment systems, methodologies and procedures too.” (Statement 3)

The task of making the appropriate arrangements to place the students in excellent positions in pertinent sectors falls on the technical boards and the relevant agencies. If it were implemented, the responsibility would fall on the shoulders of the pupils who struggle with it. They will have a difficult time locating the appropriate industrial position. One of the participants stated that while they were discussing this truth said,

“Although NVQF is a globally accepted phenomenon, the industry is still not accepting our students even at a minimum wage of 18,000 per month, which is a minimum wage for an unskilled worker, but our skilled diploma holders are not getting that. From this, you can see the value of our student’s in the eyes of the industry. I think we should double the number of

industry representatives in the assessment panel. Maybe, the final practical assessments should be made jointly with industry.” (Statement 20)

### **Language Problems**

Another problem and difficulty for vocational teachers is the decision to use English as the primary language of communication during the teaching and learning process. Additionally, kids who perform poorly academically may also have poor reading, speaking, and writing skills in the English language. Students have trouble understanding the theoretical and practical lessons even in their native tongue; thus, the subject of learning English should be taken seriously (Malay language). Additionally, these vocational teachers who are more accustomed to utilizing Urdu as a language must also create and present the educational materials. The following are some of the participants’ points of view on this issue:

“Since vocational and technical instructors are mostly certified as Assessors for various qualification levels, it is therefore recommended that Assessment Packages and Evidence Guides be developed in the Urdu Language for the better comprehension of Assessors.” (Statement 1)

“English is not taught as a subject causing a great disadvantage for employment / international placements. It should be included (linguistics module); this is more of an academic point than an assessment but valid to be guided by policymakers.” (Statement 14)

Evidently, vocational instructors find it challenging to educate in English, which is made more difficult by their inability to speak and write the language and the students’ failure to take up the language during lessons.

### **Student Competencies as a challenge**

Public perception in Pakistan of TVET limits it to serving as a skills subject substitute. Additionally, students who do well in school often continue their education at universities, polytechnics, and community colleges to take courses in engineering and technology. Students who do less academically are more likely to stay in skill-based programs for the rest of their education. The study’s participants showed these students’ greater interest in practical learning, which is probably attributable to their psychomotor instead of cognitive ability for theoretical learning. In addition, vocational instructors must maintain appropriate emotional and disciplinary composure while dealing with pupils that need more intensive instruction. These are the difficulties that vocational educators have while trying to turn pupils who lack even the most fundamental understanding of the chosen area into skilled ones. The following is how the participants characterized the situation of such students:

“Industry validation of student competency is an absolute. The way it is being done now is more like an internal assessment. Secondly, the certificates should clearly state the course modules covered, or competencies acquired and passed by the student for employment purposes. Thirdly, Level 5 assessments could be a portfolio covering projects they have designed/ executed, a worldwide practice. This is something that should be quantified and added to the final marks. So this can be presented in job interviews too.” (Statement 13)

“Practical should be taken on an individual basis and not considered an option by the examiner to assess sometimes, only verbally, some of the students. Readmission based on the record of achievement should be more conveniently administered for students. Less weightage is given to formative assessment during the final assessment (only taken as portfolio part)” (Statement 9)

“TVET graduates are generally supposed to perform well at practical, and there are cases where some students are too low in the theoretical aspect of the assessment. There should be provisions that allow such students to pass the qualifications if they can competently perform the practical exams and may not be able to pass the theory!” (Statement 19)

Even though they work hard to provide high-quality instruction, some of their students have difficult attitudes, and successful management of these pupils needs teachers to have vital emotional intelligence.

### **Discussion**

Vocational teachers must possess specialized knowledge in their chosen sectors. Based on the research, teachers find teaching new skill-related courses difficult and generally demotivating. Additionally, the newly assigned topics may not fall within the instructors’ purview and may even be

unknown to them, necessitating a thorough study of the material. As a result, it is necessary to appropriately assign these instructors the topics within the authorized domains that they are proficient in as vocational teachers. A teacher assigned to a new area must also complete the necessary training, which might result in a lack of enthusiasm for the subject. Vocational instructors must have sufficient practice and work experience in the relevant disciplines to develop competence and abilities. To improve their knowledge and skills, which ultimately motivate them, the right chances should be provided for vocational instructors to take part in relevant courses and industry attachment training programmes. This is especially important for those who welcome new challenges and want to learn.

The public skill training institutes that employ internal and external examiners must provide them with ongoing training to improve their expertise in the relevant sectors. A constant effort is made to produce competent instructors by enhancing knowledge and skills through different high-level courses. As a result, trainers who have received professional development training exhibit greater efficiency in their work (Ngure, 2013). Therefore, internal and external examiners must have the chance to participate in industrial attachment programmes, whether locally or internationally, to further their profession. Public skill training institutes should administer them impartially to encourage more vocational trainers to enroll in such programs and be exposed to cutting-edge technologies.

Additionally, to guarantee the vocational instructors' ongoing professional development, these institutions must have precise strategies, including proper funding allocation. Alternatively, trainers should take the initiative to self-learn to advance their technical expertise. Self-learning and reflection are tools that help instructors become more educated and skillful. They may, for instance, engage in self-learning via manuals and practical training using the tools and machinery accessible at their institutions.

The Competency-Based Training concept of teaching and learning was introduced into Pakistan's technical universities to produce highly competent citizens who would act as a catalyst for the industrialization of the nation's industries and their transformation into sectors promoting socio-economic development. It has significantly contributed to the industry's requirement for highly qualified graduates. Despite its many benefits and opportunities, several implementation issues must be considered for a seamless and successful implementation at the nation's technical institutions. Along with developing policy guidelines, it was necessary to address the institution's inadequate finance, lack of infrastructure and development, and institutional support. Despite this, many players in the education sector are now favouring the CBT method of teaching and learning. This study will contribute to the advancement of CBT development and implementation, specifically in technical institutions and technical and vocational education generally in Pakistan.

The majority of vocational educators are either university or polytechnic-trained engineers. The early stage of these graduates' careers as vocational instructors can be difficult. In addition, compared to more seasoned trainers, new trainers are less effective, need more time for preparing, and may run into issues while attempting to respond to pupils' learning (Mack & White, 2019). As a result, these inexperienced teachers need ongoing training and dedication to learn successful teaching techniques. Since they have the specialised technical knowledge and the ability to provide hands-on instruction while sharing genuine industry experiences with the students, vocational instructors with industrial experience have an advantage in this situation.

Teaching at public skill training institutes should be given in the Urdu language to enable efficient teaching and learning. Additionally, most students at technical institutes struggle to grasp the second language since they are less fluent in English. Additionally, enrolling in a TVET programme is a brand-new learning opportunity for many youngsters. Thus, speaking in their tongue rather than using English helps these students to learn and comprehend. Pourfeiz (2015) connected a student's personality and their desire to study English. Students who struggle to understand English may find it difficult to grasp the subject material and ultimately lose interest in their study area.

Additionally, the student could feel uncomfortable speaking and writing in English, stressing them out while they are learning a second language. As the instructors' primary responsibility is to help the students understand the subject material, they must be capable of teaching in English. In conclusion, associated policymakers should consider several factors before deciding to use English as the primary language of communication in public skill training institutes (Rasul et al., 2015). In



addition, they need to consider the students' capacity for understanding English-language teachings and the instructors' proficiency in providing successful English-language instruction.

The students are favorably motivated to study due to the good personality competency of a vocational teacher. To effectively offer good teaching and learning, these vocational instructors must understand students' abilities. Teachers with high emotional intelligence do not see students who exhibit disruptive behavior or poor academic performance as a burden. They can effectively guide the teaching and learning process, resulting in successful student learning (Schueler, 2016). Emotionally intelligent teachers make up for their emotions with high-quality job performance. This approach also makes workers more professional and effective. After all, children who do poorly in school do not inevitably have failed lives. Since teaching these TVET students' needs emotional intelligence, especially patience, the perseverance of vocational educators to convey information and skills to their pupils is admirable in and of itself. Teachers who lack these qualities are more likely to be impatient, irritated, and less concerned with the students' academic success.

### **Recommendations**

The study recommends that there be a comprehensive masterplan in TVET over time to develop a specific policy, vision, and objectives, such as enabling human resources to overcome the challenges associated with the TVET stakeholders and learning process and how TVET can be used as a pathway to industrial and economic development in the country through:

- a. Addressing the problems faced by technical education by drawing on the examples and experiences of the stakeholders.
- b. Developing an unambiguous policy, vision, and objectives for TVET; and create plans (short, medium-, and long-term) based on the stakeholders' requirements for the TVET sector's economic growth.
- d. Concentrating on the national and international training of TVET instructors, primarily from industrialized nations with a track record of success in technical education.
- e. Improving students' skills by placing them in institutions that provide a system of academic interchange so they may advance and compete in educational research.
- f. Scholarships should only be given to exceptional pupils.

### **Conclusion**

In Malaysia, skilled vocational educators foster the development of a future labour force that will be in demand. After all, the vocational instructors in different training facilities worldwide have helped create a trained workforce to satisfy industry demands. The presence of a skilled workforce is the outcome of qualified and upbeat professional vocational instructors. Vocational educators must have a good attitude throughout the teaching and learning process, devotion, perseverance, discipline, ethics, and expertise in their domains. In Pakistan, vocational teachers face several difficulties that need to be seriously addressed, including their reluctance to teach subjects, the requirement for emotional control, the requirement to write articles, and the use of English in classrooms. The critical stakeholders, especially the relevant ministries and departments, should not ignore the issues that these vocational instructors at the public skills training institutes face in daily life.

### **References**

- Anderson, P. (2009). *The new old world*. Verso Books. Chicago
- Arifin, H. M. (2015). *The Influence of competence, motivation, and organisational culture to high school teacher job satisfaction and performance*. *International Education Studies*, 8(1), 38-45.
- Beardwell, I., Holden, L., & Claydon, T. (2004). *Human resource management A contemporary approach*. (4th ed). New York: Financial Times/Prentice Hall.
- Cheong, K. C., & Lee, K. H. (2016). *Malaysia's education crisis-can TVET help?*. *Malaysian Journal of Economic Studies*, 53(1), 115-134.
- Chamadia, S., & Shahid, M. (2018). *Skilling for the future: Evaluating post-reform status of skilling Pakistan and identifying success factors for TVET Improvement in the region*. *Journal Of Technical Education And Training*, 10(1). DOI: <https://10.30880/jtet.2018.10.01.001>
- Msibi, K. J. (2021). *Technical, vocational education and training (TVET) industry stakeholders' involvement in curriculum implementation In South Africa*. Edgewood: University of KwaZulu-Natal.
- Milio, S., Garnizova, E., & Shkreli, A. (2014). Assessment study of technical and vocational education and training (TVET) in Myanmar. <https://www.lse.ac.uk/business/consulting/>

- assets/documents/assessment-study-of-technical-and-vocational-education-and-training-in-Myanmar.pdf.
- Mack, A. J., & White, D. (2019). *Challenges affecting technical vocational education and training in Trinidad and Tobago: Stakeholders' perspective. Journal of Technical Education and Training*, 11(3). Retrieved from <https://publisher.uthm.edu.my/ojs/index.php/JTET/article/view/4080>
- Mends-Brew, E., & Dadzie, J. (2016). *Partnership between TVET training institutions and industry: A survey of industrial experience of academic staff of Accra Polytechnic. Partnership*, 6(1), 131-135.
- Ngure, S. W. (2013). Where to vocational education in Kenya? Is analysing training and development needs the answer to the challenges in this sector? *Journal of Education and Vocational Research*. 4 (6), pp. 193-204.
- Ngware, M. W., Ochieng', V., Kiroro, F., Hungi, N., & Muchira, J. M. (2022). Assessing the acquisition of whole youth development skills among students in TVET institutions in Kenya. *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 1-26.
- Ngure, S. W. (2013). *Stakeholders' perceptions of technical, vocational education and training: the case of Kenyan micro and small enterprises in the motor vehicle service and repair industry* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation), Edith Cowan University, Western Australia.
- Ngubane, P., Mncube, D. W., Mabusela, M. S., & Olaniran, S. O. (2020). Exploratory study of TVET Stakeholders' experiences of Implementing Work-Based Education In Rural Ecology. *Academy of Entrepreneurship Journal*, 26(1), 1-12.
- Ode-sri, A., Köhler, T., & Wimonthanasit, P. (2021, September). Need Analysis of Stakeholders' Perspectives Regarding the Challenging Factors in Establishing the CoE for TVET in Thailand. In *International Conference on Interactive Collaborative Learning* (pp. 91-103). Springer, Cham.
- Pirzada, G. (2020). Effect of including global TVET worldview in TIMT (TVET) Institute Management Training) on vocational institute management in Pakistan. Retrieved from [https://tvvet-online.asia/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/05\\_Gouhar-Pirzada\\_Effect\\_2020-07-20\\_Vorlage-Final-1.pdf](https://tvvet-online.asia/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/05_Gouhar-Pirzada_Effect_2020-07-20_Vorlage-Final-1.pdf)
- Pirzada, G. (2022). Art & Design students' perspectives on work-integrated learning and challenges: a case study of STEP Institute of Art, Design & Management, Pakistan. *TVET@ Asia*, (18), 1-15.
- Pirzada, G., Muhammad, Y., & Anis, F. (2020). Promoting 21st-century TVET skills in Pakistan: Teachers' perceptions. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 4(2), 986-1001.
- Pirzada, G., Muhammad, Y., & Ahmed, F. (2021). TVET trainers understanding of engaging instruction: The learning challenge. *Journal of Educational Research & Social Science Review*, 1(3), 25-35.
- Pirzada, G., Muhammad, Y., & Masood, S. (2021). TVET trainers' understanding of engaging instruction: Enriching training experience. *VFAST Transactions on Education and Social Sciences*, 9(3), 37-47.
- Pourfeiz, J. (2015). Exploring the relationship between global personality traits and attitudes toward foreign language learning. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 186, 467-473.
- Ramaligela, S. M. (2022). Student's Perceptions of assessment legitimacy in TVET Sector in South Africa. In *Research Anthology on Vocational Education and Preparing Future Workers* (pp. 452-467). IGI Global.
- Rasul, M. S., Ashari, Z. H., Azman, N., & Rauf, R. A. (2015). Transforming TVET in Malaysia: Harmonizing the governance structure in a multiple stakeholder setting. *The Online Journal for Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Asia*, 4, 1-12.
- Schueler, J. (2016). *Evaluation framework measuring Return on Investment (ROI) in TVET*. Adelaide: NCVER.
- Wahba, M. (2012). Technical and vocational education and training (TVET) challenges and priorities in developing countries. Retrieved from [https://unevoc.unesco.org/e-forum/TVET\\_Challenges\\_and\\_Priorities\\_in\\_Developing\\_Countries.pdf](https://unevoc.unesco.org/e-forum/TVET_Challenges_and_Priorities_in_Developing_Countries.pdf).